The Oxford Handbook of Sociology and Organization Studies: Classical Foundations

Edited by Paul S. Adler

Downloaded from http://www-bcf.usc.edu/~padler/
THE OXFORD HANDBOOK OF

SOCIOLOGY AND ORGANIZATION STUDIES

CLASSICAL FOUNDATIONS

Edited by

PAUL S. ADLER

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
Preface

The genesis of this volume lies in conversations with numerous colleagues over several years about our shared frustration with the growing divorce between organization studies and one of its key source disciplines, sociology. I took a proposal for an edited volume aimed at bridging that gap to David Musson at Oxford University Press: David’s strong encouragement and wise counsel helped give it its current form. Over the course of 2006–7, I reached out to potential contributors, and the response was overwhelmingly positive.

Drafts chapters benefited from discussion at a conference held at Wharton in August 2007. Along with the chapter authors, the participating faculty were: Mie Augier (Stanford), Peter Bryant (Macquarie), Jordi Comas (Bucknell), Marlese Durr (Wright State), Isabel Fernandez-Mateo (London Business School), Michal Frenkel (Hebrew Univ.), Zeke Hasenfeld (UCLA), Roberta Iversen (Pennsylvania), Candace Jones (Boston College), Shamus Khan (Columbia), Brayden King (Brigham Young), Sheen Levine (Singapore Mgt. Univ.), Marshall Meyer (Pennsylvania), Ilya Okhmatovskiy (McGill), Sean Safford (Chicago), Samps Samila (Brock), Russell Schutt (Univ. Mass., Boston), Wesley Sine (Cornell), Klaus Weber (Northwestern), and Ray Zammuto (Melbourne). Graduate students too participated in this discussion: Ebony Bridwell-Mitchell (NYU), Ed Carberry (Cornell), Jay Chok (Univ. of Southern Calif.), Anne Fleischer (Michigan), Steve Hoffman (Northwestern), Maksim Kokushkin (Missouri), Andrew Parker (Stanford), Renee Rottner (UC Irvine), Laura Singleton (Boston College), Elizabeth Terrien (Chicago), Matt Vidal (UCLA ILRE), and Peggy Wallace (St Marys). We thank all these colleagues for their immensely helpful constructive criticism.

We also thank the National Science Foundation and in particular Jacqueline Meszaros for funding the conference under Grant No. 0706814. Generous financial support also came from my home department, the Management and Organization Department of the Marshall School at the University of Southern California. My department colleagues there, notably Tom Cummings, Mark Kennedy, and Peer Fiss, provided essential encouragement and guidance throughout. Jay Chok provided crucial research and administrative assistance. Our editor, Lynn Deanne Childress, was exceptionally helpful in structural revision and copyediting.

Paul S. Adler
Los Angeles, August 2008
CONTENTS

List of Figures xi
List of Tables xii
Notes on Contributors xiii

PART I THE ROLE OF THE CLASSICS

1. Introduction: A Social Science which Forgets its Founders is Lost 3
   Paul S. Adler

2. The Value of the Classics 20
   Patricia H. Thornton

PART II EUROPEAN PERSPECTIVES

3. Tocqueville as a Pioneer in Organization Theory 39
   Richard Swedberg

4. Marx and Organization Studies Today 62
   Paul S. Adler

5. It’s Not Just for Communists Any More: Marxian Political Economy and Organizational Theory 92
   Richard Marens

6. Sintering the Iron Cage: Translation, Domination, and Rationality 118
   Stewart Clegg and Michael Lounsbury

7. Max Weber and the Ethics of Office 146
   Paul du Gay

8. On Organizations and Oligarchies: Michels in the Twenty-First Century 174
   Pamela S. Tolbert and Shon R. Hiatt
viii CONTENTS

9. How Durkheim’s Theory of Meaning-Making Influenced Organizational Sociology
   Frank Dobbin
   200

10. A Durkheimian Approach to Globalization
    Paul Hirsch, Peer C. Fiss, and Amanda Hoel-Green
    223

11. Gabriel Tarde and Organization Theory
    Barbara Czarniawska
    246

    Alan Scott
    268

13. Types and Positions: The Significance of Georg Simmel’s Structural Theories for Organizational Behavior
    Rosabeth Moss Kanter and Rakesh Khurana
    291

14. Schumpeter and the Organization of Entrepreneurship
    Markus C. Becker and Thorbjørn Knudsen
    307

15. Norbert Elias’s Impact on Organization Studies
    Ad Van Iterson
    322

PART III AMERICAN PERSPECTIVES

16. Thorstein Veblen and the Organization of the Capitalist Economy
    Gary G. Hamilton and Misha Petrovic
    351

    Stella M. Nkomo
    375

18. Organizations and the Chicago School
    Andrew Abbott
    399

19. After James on Identity
    Arne Carlsen
    421

20. Reading Dewey: Some Implications for the Study of Routine
    Michael D. Cohen
    444

21. Mary Parker Follett and Pragmatist Organization
    Christopher Ansell
    464
22. Peopling Organizations: The Promise of Classic Symbolic Interactionism for an Inhabited Institutionalism  
   Tim Hallett, David Shulman, and Gary Alan Fine  
   486

23. John R. Commons: Back to the Future of Organization Studies  
   Andrew H. Van de Ven and Arik Lifschitz  
   510

24. The Problem of the Corporation: Liberalism and the Large Organization  
   Elisabeth S. Clemens  
   535

25. Bureaucratic Theory and Intellectual Renewal in Contemporary Organization Studies  
   Mike Reed  
   559

26. The Columbia School and the Study of Bureaucracies: Why Organizations Have Lives of their Own  
   Heather A. Haveman  
   585

27. Parsons as an Organization Theorist  
   Charles Heckscher  
   607

**PART IV AFTERWORD**

28. Afterword: Sociological Classics and the Canon in the Study of Organizations  
   Gerald F. Davis and Mayer N. Zald  
   635

*Index*  
647
List of Figures

3.1. Choices in democratic society, according to Democracy in America 49
3.2. Choices in aristocratic society, according to The Old Regime and the Revolution 56
3.3. The full conceptual scheme in Tocqueville’s work 58
14.1. Schumpeter’s typology of innovation 311
14.2. The number of references to Schumpeter’s work in the top economics, sociology, and organization theory journals 314
20.1. The Simon perspective (left) compared to the Dewey perspective (right) 449
27.1. The four functions and social-system institutions 611
27.2. The interchange paradigm (Parsons and Platt 1973: 426) 612
27.3. Parson’s definition of societal G–I interchanges (Parsons and Platt 1973: 432) 619
27.4. G–I interchanges in collaborative enterprises 619
27.5. Exchanges in paternalist bureaucracies 620
27.6. Exchanges in collaborative enterprises 621
27.7. Detailed exchanges in collaborative enterprises—integrative focus 622
28.1. Proportion of the US non-farm labor force employed in manufacturing and retail, 1939–2007 642
List of Tables

2.1. Examples of research streams ................................................... 25
10.1. Dimensions of transformation at the end of the nineteenth and twenty-first centuries ................................................. 231
12.1. The boundaries of social circles ............................................. 282
13.1. Three types of relations ................................................... 295
14.1. Schumpeter’s typology of entrepreneurial motivation ............... 316
23.1. Scope of transactions ................................................... 515
23.2. Theories of valuation ................................................... 530
Notes on Contributors

Andrew Abbott is the Gustavus F. and Ann M. Swift Distinguished Service Professor at the University of Chicago. Known for his ecological theories of occupations, Abbott has also pioneered algorithmic analysis of social sequence data. He has written on the foundations of social science methodology and on the evolution of the social sciences and the academic system. He is the author of five books and sixty articles and chapters.


Chris Ansell is an Associate Professor of Political Science at the University of California, Berkeley and holds a Ph.D. in Political Science from the University of Chicago. His research focuses on understanding conflict and cooperation in interorganizational and intergovernmental systems. He is the author of Schism and Solidarity in Social Movements (Cambridge, 2001) and co-editor of Restructuring Territoriality: Europe and the United States Compared (Cambridge, 2004) and What's the Beef? The Contested Governance of European Food Safety (MIT Press, 2006).

Markus C. Becker holds a Ph.D. in Management from the Judge Business School, Cambridge University. He has held positions with the Centre National de Recherche Scientifique (CNRS) at the University of Strasbourg, France, and with the University of Southern Denmark. He currently is Professor of Organization Theory at the Strategic Organization Design Unit, Department of Marketing & Management, University of Southern Denmark.

Arne Carlsen is a Senior Scientist at SINTEF Technology and Management in Norway. Much of his research has been linked to practical development processes in and with professional service organizations. He has published in journals and books about knowledge management, professional service work, and identity formation at work. He is broadly interested in temporality, narrative theory, pragmatism and
positive psychology, and is presently most curious about the various practices of ‘idea work’ in organizations.

Stewart Clegg is Professor at the University of Technology, Sydney and Research Director of the Centre for Management and Organization Studies. He is a prolific publisher in leading academic journals in management and organization theory. He is a Fellow of the Academy of the Social Sciences in Australia and a Distinguished Fellow of the Australian and New Zealand Academy of Management.

Elisabeth S. Clemens is Associate Professor of Sociology at the University of Chicago. Building on organizational theory and political sociology, her research has addressed the role of social movements and voluntary organizations in institutional change. Her first book, *The People’s Lobby: Organizational Innovation and the Rise of Interest Group Politics in the United States, 1890–1925* (Chicago, 1997) received awards in both organizational and political sociology. She is also co-editor of *Private Action and the Public Good* (Yale, 1998), *Remaking Modernity: Politics, History, and Sociology* (Duke, 2005), *Politics and Partnerships: Voluntary Associations in America’s Past and Present* (Chicago, forthcoming), and the journal *Studies in American Political Development*.

Michael D. Cohen is William D. Hamilton Professor of Complex Systems, Information, and Public Policy at the University of Michigan. He has worked on the ‘garbage can’ model of organizational choice and other agent-based models of organization. He has studied leadership in higher education organization, models of organizational learning, the complex adaptive dynamics of cooperation, and the psychological foundations of routinized action. He is co-author, with Robert Axelrod, of *Harnessing Complexity*.


Gerald F. Davis is the Wilbur K. Pierpont Collegiate Professor of Management at the Ross School of Business and Professor of Sociology at the University of Michigan. Davis’s research examines the interactions among financial markets, institutions, and social structure. Recent publications include *Social Movements and Organization Theory* (Cambridge University Press; co-edited with Doug McAdam, W. Richard Scott, and Mayer Zald) and *Organizations and Organizing: Rational, Natural, and Open System Perspectives* (Pearson Prentice Hall; with W. Richard Scott).

Paul du Gay is Professor of Organizational Behaviour at Warwick Business School and Adjunct Professor of Organization at Copenhagen Business School. He was formerly Professor of Sociology and Organization Studies and a Director of the Centre for Citizenship, Identities and Governance (CCIG) at the Open University. Recent and forthcoming publications include: The Values of Bureaucracy (ed. Oxford University Press, 2005), Organizing Identity: Persons and Organizations ‘After Theory’ (Sage, 2007), Conduct: Sociology and Social Worlds (ed. with E. McFall and S. Carter, Manchester University Press, 2008), and Identity in Question (ed. with A. Elliott, Sage, 2008).

Gary Alan Fine is John Evans Professor of Sociology at Northwestern University. He received his Ph.D. degree from Harvard University in Social Psychology in 1976. He is written on issues of symbolic interaction for over thirty years, including editing a four-volume collection of articles commenting on the work of Erving Goffman and ‘The Second Chicago School’. He received the George Herbert Mead Award for lifetime contributions to symbolic interaction.

Peer Fiss is Assistant Professor of Strategy at the Marshall School of Business at the University of Southern California. He received his Ph.D. from the Departments of Management & Organization and Sociology at Northwestern University. His current research interests include corporate governance and the diffusion of practices, framing and symbolic management, and the use of set-theoretic methods such as Qualitative Comparative Analysis (QCA) and fuzzy sets in management and the social sciences.

Tim Hallett is Assistant Professor in the Department of Sociology at Indiana University. He received his Ph.D. from Northwestern University in Sociology in 2003. His research lies at the intersections of social psychology, organizations, and culture. In addition to his research on inhabited institutionalism (with Marc Ventresca, Theory and Society 2007), he has published articles on symbolic power and organizational culture (Social Psychology Quarterly, 2007 and Sociological Theory, 2003), and how emotions ‘blow up’ in organizations (The Sociological Quarterly, 2003). His current work integrates these concerns by examining how the process of ‘recoupling’ organizations to their institutional environments creates local turmoil.
Gary G. Hamilton is a Professor of Sociology and of International Studies at the University of Washington. He specializes in historical/comparative sociology, economic sociology, and organizational sociology. He also specializes in Asian societies, with particular emphasis on Chinese societies. He is an author of numerous articles and books, including most recently Emergent Economies, Divergent Paths: Economic Organization and International Trade in South Korea and Taiwan (with Robert Feenstra, Cambridge University Press, 2006) and Commerce and Capitalism in Chinese Societies (Routledge, 2006).

Heather A. Haveman is Professor of Sociology and Business at the University of California, Berkeley. She studies how organizations, industries, and employees’ careers evolve. Her published studies have appeared in Administrative Science Quarterly, the American Sociological Review, the American Journal of Sociology, Poetics, Organization Science, the Journal of Business Venturing, and the Academy of Management Journal. Her current research involves antebellum American magazines, post-Prohibition US wineries, and twenty-first-century Chinese firms.

Charles Heckscher is a Professor at Rutgers University and Director of the Center for Workplace Transformation. His research focuses on organization change and the changing nature of employee representation. Before coming to Rutgers he worked for the Communications Workers’ union and taught Human Resources Management at the Harvard Business School. His books include The New Unionism, White-Collar Blues, Agents of Change, and The Collaborative Enterprise.

Shon Hiatt is a Ph.D. candidate in organizational behavior at Cornell University. His research looks at the effects of institutional factors on entrepreneurial opportunity creation, discovery, and exploitation. He also investigates the organizational processes, strategy, and networks of firms in mature and emerging economies. Currently, Shon is investigating the effect of environmental elements and firm strategies on US biodiesel adoption and production and the impact of military ties on companies in Latin America.

Paul Hirsch is the James Allen Distinguished Professor of Strategy and Organization at Northwestern University’s Kellogg School of Management, where he is also a member of the Sociology and Communication Studies Departments. Hirsch’s research spans economic sociology, institutional theory, culture, and communication studies. He has studied the discourse of corporate takeovers, interviewed Studs Terkel, and addressed issues in institutional and organization theory, and mass communication. Hirsch’s articles have appeared in American Journal of Sociology, Work and Occupations, Theory and Society, Administrative Science Quarterly, and the New York Times.

Amanda Hoel-Green is a Masters Degree candidate in Management and Organization at Northwestern University’s Kellogg School of Management. She is interested
XVI  Notes on Contributors

in sociology and public policy issues, and in how attention to classical theories enhances our understanding of both.

Rosabeth Moss Kanter holds the Ernest L. Arbuckle Professorship at Harvard Business School, where she specializes in strategy, innovation, and leadership for change. The former editor of Harvard Business Review (1989–1992), Professor Kanter is the author or co-author of seventeen books, which have been translated into seventeen languages. Among her best-known are: Men & Women of the Corporation, When Giants Learn to Dance, and The Change Masters. She chairs a Harvard University group creating an innovative initiative on advanced leadership, to help successful leaders at the top of their professions apply their skills to addressing challenging national and global problems.

Rakesh Khurana is Associate Professor of Organizational Behavior at Harvard Business School. He received his Ph.D. (Organizational Behavior) and A.M. (Sociology) from Harvard University. His research focuses on the sociology of elites, leadership, and governance. He is the author of From Higher Aims to Hired Hands: The Social Transformation of American Business Schools and the Unfulfilled Promise of Management as a Profession (Princeton University Press, 2007) and Searching for a Corporate Savior: The Irrational Question for Charismatic CEOs (Princeton University Press, 2002). He is currently researching the impact of financial markets on corporate governance and the social structure of global elites.

Thorbjørn Knudsen is Professor at the Strategic Organization Design Unit, Department of Marketing and Management, University of Southern Denmark. His research interests and publications focus on economic evolution and decision making in organizations.

Arik Lifschitz is Assistant Professor of Strategic Management and Organization at the Carlson School of Management, University of Minnesota. He studies the role of institutions and interorganizational networks in the behavior and performance of firms. His co-authored paper with Paul Ingram, ‘Kinship in the Shadow of the Corporation: The Interbuilder Network in Clyde River Shipbuilding, 1711–1990,’ was recently published in the American Sociological Review.

Michael Lounsbury is a Professor at the University of Alberta, School of Business. His research focuses on the relationship between organizational and institutional change, entrepreneurial dynamics, and the emergence of new industries and practices. He is currently investigating the co-evolution of nanoscience and nanotechnology. Professor Lounsbury serves on a number of editorial boards and is the series editor of Research in the Sociology of Organizations and co-editor in-chief of Journal of Management Inquiry.

Richard Marens is an Associate Professor of Management at the California State University, Sacramento. He earned both a J.D. and a Ph.D. from the University of
Washington and has published in a number of management and ethics journals. His research interests include: the emergence of labor unions as innovative financial activists and the evolution of the construct of Corporate Social Responsibility within the context of American social and economic history.

Stella M. Nkomo is a professor of business leadership at the University of South Africa’s Graduate School of Business Leadership. Her nationally recognized work on race and gender in organizations, managing diversity, and human resource management appears in numerous journals, edited volumes, and magazines. She is the co-author of, Our Separate Ways: Black and White Women and the Struggle for Professional Identity (Harvard Business School Press). Professor Nkomo is listed in the Who’s Who in the Managerial Sciences.

Misha Petrovic (Ph.D., Sociology, University of Washington, Seattle, 2005) is Assistant Professor in the Department of Sociology, National University of Singapore, where he teaches classical and contemporary social theory. His primary research interests are in economic sociology, social theory, and globalization, and his most recent research deals with the development of consumer goods markets in China.

Michael I. Reed is Professor of Organisational Analysis (Human Resource Management Section) and Associate Dean (Research), Cardiff Business School, Cardiff University, Wales. He has published widely in major international journals and book-length monographs in the areas of organization theory and analysis, expert work and knowledge organizations, public services organization and management, and organizational futures. He is a member of several leading international academic associations, such as the American Academy of Management, the European Group for Organisation Studies, the British Sociological Association, and the British Academy of Management (Council Member as from 2004). He is one of the founding editors of the international journal, Organization, published by Sage.

Alan Scott is Professor of Sociology at the University of Innsbruck, Austria. His research and teaching interests cover political and organizational sociology, and social theory. With respect to organization studies, he is editor of a recent collection on universities and their (regional) external environment, Bright Satanic Mills (Ashgate, 2007), and is a board member of the International Sociological Association’s RC17, Organizational Sociology. With respect to social theory, he has published on Weber, Durkheim, and (Karl) Polanyi, and is co-editor and co-translator of Georg Simmel’s Rembrandt (Routledge, 2005).

David Shulman is Associate Professor of Anthropology and Sociology at Lafayette College. He received his Ph.D. degree from Northwestern University in Sociology in 1997. He has published articles on deception, dramaturgy, and symbolic interactionism. He recently published a book analyzing impression management and lying
at work entitled *From Hire to Liar: The Role of Deception in the Workplace* (Cornell University Press, 2007).


**Patricia H. Thornton** is Adjunct Professor and affiliate of the Center for Entrepreneurship and Innovation at Duke University, Fuqua School of Business and Associate Professor visiting at Stanford University, Department of Sociology. She holds a Ph.D. (1993) in Sociology from Stanford University. Her research and teaching interests are in organization theory, economic sociology, and entrepreneurship. Her research focuses on developing and testing theories on the impact of culture, organization structure, and institutional change on entrepreneurial decisions. She is published in the *American Journal of Sociology*, *The Annual Review of Sociology*, *The Academy of Management Journal*, and *Organization Science*. She won the award for the best scholarly research article by the OOW section of ASA. Her book *Markets from Culture* (2004) chronicles her cumulative research program on institutional logics and organization decisions.

**Pamela Tolbert** is Professor and chair of the Department of Organizational Behavior in the School of Industrial Relations at Cornell University. She came to the ILR School after receiving her Ph.D. in sociology from UCLA. She is broadly interested in processes of organizational change, the role of organizations in social stratification, and the impact of occupations on organizational structures. Her current research includes studies of the use of tenure systems by higher education organizations, the effects of social movements on organizational foundings and failures, sources of variations in the organizational features of hedge funds, and the effects of earnings differences within dual-career couples on spousal relationships.

**Andrew H. Van de Ven** is Vernon H. Heath Professor of Organizational Innovation and Change in the Carlson School of Management at the University of Minnesota. He received his Ph.D. from the University of Wisconsin, Madison in 1972, and taught at the Wharton School of the University of Pennsylvania before his present appointment. He is author of several books including *The Innovation Journey* (1999) and *Engaged Scholarship: A Guide for Organizational and Social Research* (2007). Van de Ven was 2000–2001 President of the Academy of Management.

**Ad Van Iterson** is Associate Professor of Organization Studies at Maastricht University, the Netherlands. He graduated in sociology at the University of Amsterdam, after which he received his Ph.D. with a thesis on the early factory system. Currently, he mainly publishes on micro-sociological processes in organizations, such as
notes on contributors

Gossip and cynicism, as manifestations of wider (de)civilizing trends: e.g. Van Iterson et al. (eds.), *The Civilized Organization: Norbert Elias and the Future of Organization Studies* (2002). He also writes novels and columns.

**Mayer N. Zald** is Professor of Sociology, Social Work, and Business Administration (emeritus) at the University of Michigan. He has published more than fifty articles and written or edited eighteen books. He has published on many topics, including sociology of social welfare, political sociology, social movements, and complex organizations. In 2005, he edited (with Gerald Davis, W. Richard Scott, and Doug McAdam) a volume of essays on the relationship of social movement theory to organizational theory and research (Cambridge University Press). Currently, he is continuing his work on complex organizations and social movements and is also working on a long-term project to more adequately link social science to the humanities. He is a member of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences and a three-time Fellow of the Center for the Advancement of the Behavioral Sciences.